Rikhan Luhur Prasetya 1*, Meidiana Dwidiyanti 2, Nur Setiawati Dewi 2

1 Master of Nursing Science Program, Department of Nursing, Faculty of Medicine, Diponegoro University, Indonesia

2 Department of Psychiatric and Community Nursing, Faculty of Medicine, Diponegoro University, Indonesia

*Correspondence: Rikhan Luhur Prasetya
Master of Nursing Science Program, Department of Nursing, Faculty of Medicine, Diponegoro University, Indonesia
Jl. Prof. Soedarto, Tembalang, Kec. Tembalang, Kota Semarang, Jawa Tengah 50275
Email: rikhanlp@gmail.com

Article Info:
Received: December 9, 2021
Revised: June 16, 2022
Accepted: June 25, 2022

DOI:
https://doi.org/10.36720/nhjk.v11i1.352

Abstract
Background: Undergraduate nursing students have experienced high levels of anxiety caused by academic, clinical practice, and final assignments. This anxiety results in a decrease in students’ intellectual abilities and the risk of experiencing academic failures. Mindfulness is an effective intervention for reducing anxiety.

Objectives: This scoping review aims to determine the kind of mindfulness interventions to reduce anxiety in undergraduate nursing students.

Design: This study used a scoping review through a review of articles on the kind of mindfulness interventions to reduce anxiety in undergraduate nursing students.

Data Sources: Search for articles accessed through a database, including: Science Direct, Scopus, Semantic Scholar, ProQuest and SpringerLink with a range of search years 2017 to 2021. The search for articles uses the boolean method of the “OR/AND” operator. The keywords used in the article search were “Mindfulness” AND “Anxiety” AND “Undergraduate”, AND “Nursing” OR “Mindfulness Based Cognitive Therapy” OR “Mindfulness Based Stress Reduction” OR “Mindfulness Based”.

Review Methods: This article uses Arksey and O'Melley's model in the analysis. Identification and analysis using Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Reviews and Meta-Analysis for Scoping Review (PRISMA-SR).

Results: The result of this literature review show contains 5 quantitative articles. This article summarizes the kind of mindfulness interventions used to reduce anxiety in nursing students are mindfulness based cognitive therapy, mindfulness meditation, virtual community mindfulness, mindfulness through smartphones, and spiritual mindfulness. Mindfulness intervention provides serenity, focus on the situation with full awareness, acceptance, improvement in physical health, psychological, empathy, and well-being. The mindfulness was carried out 6 times in a series of interventions. The stages of mindfulness interventions vary widely, but the point is to focus attention and acceptance with awareness.

Conclusion: The kind of mindfulness interventions used to reduce anxiety in nursing students including: mindfulness based cognitive therapy, mindfulness meditation, virtual community mindfulness, mindfulness spiritual Islam and acceptance, and spiritual mindfulness.

Keywords: Mindfulness, Anxiety, Undergraduate, Nursing.
INTRODUCTION

Most undergraduate nursing students have experienced academic and clinical anxiety (Labrague, McEnroe-Petitte, De Los Santos, & Edet, 2018). Anxiety that occurs due to the transition process from the previous level of education. The process of transitioning from adolescence to adulthood is a phase that nursing undergraduate students go through. This transition process affects academic life from student status to student status is a complex process, which will go through a process of dealing with various stressors that arise and must be able to adapt to the new environment (Floyd, 2015).

Study focusing on anxiety of nursing students in Belgium 34.9% of first-year students experience anxiety mental health problems due to the transition process and lead to decreased academic achievement (Bruffaerts et al., 2018). While in Portugal 14.5% of students experience anxiety disorders this has an impact on academic learning outcomes result (Sarmento, 2015). Research in Indonesia revealed that 27.6% experienced anxiety and 13% experienced severe anxiety in nursing students when facing exams (Anissa, Suryani, & Mirwanti, 2018). Other data revealing the anxiety of nursing students conducted by Wiguna et al (Wiguna, Dwidiyanti, & Sari, 2019) revealed that 50% of final year nursing students experience anxiety due to their final project.

Based on the data mentioned above, nursing student anxiety has a more negative impact on academic achievement (Bamber & Schneider, 2016). Mild level of anxiety can have a positive effect on students increasing efficiency and intellectual function. However, when the level of anxiety is moderate to panic, it will cause negative things, namely a decrease in the ability to study skills and poor academic results that are at risk of failure (Bamber & Schneider, 2016). High levels of anxiety and emotion were identified as impeding memory, concentration and problem-solving abilities, this could impede academic performance and learning. So it is necessary to deal with anxiety problems in early-level students so as not to cause a decrease in academic achievement.

Students need to know the management of anxiety, stress, and emotions. When students control anxiety well, it will improve the management of adaptive intrapersonal skills in the academic learning process (Aydin & Yucel, 2014). This will have an impact on increasing academic achievement. Innovative approaches with appropriate intervention strategies in nursing student groups can control anxiety problems.

Intervention strategies for student anxiety that have been carried out previously include mindfulness meditation training, basic clinical skill refresher course, guide reflection, structured learning program, mindfulness meditation intermixed with humour, progressive muscle relaxation and muscle relaxation program. Based on the existing intervention strategy, the intervention that is considered to overcome anxiety is mindfulness which gives significant results on student anxiety (Aloufi, Jarden, Gerdtz, & Kapp, 2021).

Mindfulness provides serenity, focus on the situation with full awareness and acceptance. (Asiah, Dwidiyanti, Wijayanti, & Yuli, 2019) Nursing students who have been doing mindfulness intervention techniques have shown subjective improvements in physical health, psychological, empathy, and well-being (Bamber & Schneider, 2016; Chen, Yang, Wang, & Zhang, 2013; McConville, McAleer, & Hahne, 2017). Anxiety can be decreased by widening the field of view and thoughts of the stressor that occurs. This happens to nursing students who experience anxiety due to stressors such as academic...
pressure and the campus environment can adapt with full awareness and acceptance with mindfulness.

Several previous studies have shown that there are many intervention strategies to reduce anxiety (Aloufi et al., 2021). However, it does not focus on nursing students as the object of intervention. Therefore, it is very necessary to conduct an in-depth exploration of the types of mindfulness interventions to reduce nursing student anxiety through scoping reviews. This scoping review aims to obtain various types of mindfulness interventions and explanations of mindfulness interventions that can be used to reduce nursing student anxiety.

METHODS

Design

This review article uses the Arksey and O’Malley method. MethodArksey & O’Malley (Arksey & O’Malley, 2005), in conducting a scoping review analysis must go through five stages. The five stages consist of identifying research questions according to the topic, identifying research that is relevant to the topic taken, selecting research related to the topic, conducting analysis using a data matrix, and interpreting the findings. This article contains a review question, namely “What are the types of mindfulness interventions to overcome anxiety problems in undergraduate nursing students?”.

Search Methods

Articles were collected through the online databases of Sciedirect, Scopus, Semantic Scholar, ProQuest and SpringerLink. The articles used are published in the range of 2017 to 2021. The search for articles uses the boolean method of the “OR/AND” operator. The keywords used in the article search were “Mindfulness” AND “Anxiety” AND “Undergraduate”, AND “Nursing” OR “Mindfulness Based Cognitive Therapy” OR “Mindfulness Based Stress Reduction” OR “Mindfulness Based.

Search Outcome

The inclusion and exclusion criteria were as follows:

Table 1. Literature criteria

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Research Characteristic</th>
<th>Inclusion Criteria</th>
<th>Exclusion Criteria</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Design</td>
<td>Randomized control trial design, and quasi experimental</td>
<td>Descriptive study, case study, prevalence, diagnostic</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Respondents</td>
<td>Undergraduate nursing students</td>
<td>Not undergraduate nursing students</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Intervention</td>
<td>Mindfulness therapy interventions</td>
<td>Not mindfulness therapy interventions</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Measurement result</td>
<td>There is a measure of anxiety in undergraduate nursing students</td>
<td>There are no reports of anxiety of undergraduate nursing students</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Data was selected by deleting duplicates, articles below from the last 5 years, and articles that were not full text. The most important part of research selection is to use mindfulness intervention and explain the outcome for anxiety undergraduate nursing students (Arksey & O’Malley, 2005).

Quality Appraisal

In this scoping review, the search for independent literature uses reliable data based. The articles obtained were then analyzed to find the required data, analyzed for similarities and differences. Titles, abstracts, and articles were reviewed according to the inclusion and exclusion criterions. The data used in each article found are full text, year of study, type of intervention, population and results. Figure 1 describes the process of searching and selecting articles used by using Preferred Reporting Items for Systematic Review and Meta-analysis for Scoping Review (PRISMA-SR) (Selcuk, 2019).
NURSE AND HEALTH: JURNAL KEPERAWATAN, VOL 11, ISSUE 1, JANUARY-JUNE 2022

Prasetya, R.L., et al. (2022)

Data Abstraction

Two authors independently analyzed study citations extracted from the database. Find and read the full text of potentially relevant articles. For studies that met the inclusion criteria, data extraction was performed independently by two investigators using a standard data extraction template. Extraction discrepancy resolved by third investigator.

Figure 1. The PRISMA Flow Diagram of the Literature Review

Data Analysis/ Synthesis

A total of 475 articles were obtained as literature sources from Sciencedirect (217 articles), Scopus (4 articles), Semantic scholar (180 articles), ProQuest (39 articles), Springerlink (35 articles). There are 3 similar articles based on data to be excluded and the remaining 473 articles. Furthermore, from 473 articles, 351 articles were excluded because they only contained theories and discussions, were not in English, the articles were not related to the topic and were not original articles. The results of the article screening obtained 121 articles and an exception was made regarding articles that did not examine student anxiety and the completeness of the articles obtained 5 articles that would be analysed discussing the types of mindfulness interventions to reduce nursing student anxiety.

RESULTS

There are 5 articles obtained from different countries, including Turkey, Texas, Canada, Indonesia, and Iran. Research design with quasi-experimental 4 articles and 1 article with randomized control trial.

The results show a summary of the types of mindfulness interventions used to reduce anxiety in nursing students, including: mindfulness-based cognitive therapy, mindfulness meditation, virtual mindfulness communities, mindfulness spiritual Islam and acceptance, and spiritual mindfulness.

Table 3. Summary of Included Article kind of Mindfulness Interventions to Reduce Nursing Student Anxiety.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Authors, year, country</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Research and sample design</th>
<th>Findings</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Yüksel, 2020, Turkey (Yüksel &amp; Bahadır Yılmaz, 2020)</td>
<td>The effects group mindfulness-based cognitive therapy in nursing students: a quasi-experimental study.</td>
<td>Quasy-experimental study with non-anxiety scores in the randomized control intervention group after group pre-test and post-being given mindfulness-based cognitive therapy</td>
<td>There was a decrease in study with non-anxiety scores in the randomized control intervention group after group pre-test and post-being given mindfulness-based cognitive therapy</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>No.</td>
<td>Authors, year, country</td>
<td>Title</td>
<td>Research and sample design</td>
<td>Findings</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----</td>
<td>------------------------</td>
<td>-------</td>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td>----------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Prasetya, R.L., et al. (2022)</td>
<td>Research and sample design</td>
<td>There were 82 second year nursing student respondents, with a decrease in anxiety scores from 9.87 to 8.75.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2</td>
<td>Stinson, 2020, Texas (Stinson et al., 2020)</td>
<td>Mindfulness meditation and anxiety in nursing students</td>
<td>Quasy-experimental study with convenience sample. There were 166 nursing intervention group with a statistically significant reduction in anxiety traits found in the first and second years.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3</td>
<td>Ahmad, 2020, Canada (Ahmad et al., 2020)</td>
<td>An eight-week, web-based mindfulness virtual community intervention for students’ mental health</td>
<td>Randomized control trial conducted with 4 parallels. There were 113 mental internet-based nursing student mindfulness interventions with a change in value (7.35; p=0.01).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4</td>
<td>Wiguna, 2019, Indonesia (Wiguna et al., 2019)</td>
<td>The effect of mindfulness through smartphone applications on the anxiety of final-level nursing</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>5</td>
<td>Jenaabadi, 2018, Iran (Jenaabadi, 2018)</td>
<td>The role of spiritual intelligence and mindfulness in predicting death anxiety among students at Zahedan faculty of nursing</td>
<td>Descriptive-correlation with stratified random anxiety in nursing sampling. There are 260 nursing student respondents. There is a decrease in average anxiety score from 8.1 to 8.66 (Yüksel &amp; Bahadır Yılmaz, 2020).</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Mindfulness Based Cognitive Therapy**

Mindfulness based cognitive therapy is an exercise that focuses on dysfunctional and negative thoughts from common sense, testing and challenging dysfunctional beliefs and creating new interpretations, and reinforcing more adaptive responses. (Yüksel & Bahadır Yılmaz, 2020). Existing research shows that the results of mindfulness-based cognitive therapy interventions in the anxiety intervention group of nursing students decreased the average anxiety score from 9.87 to 8.75, while the control group experienced an increase in the average anxiety score from 8.1 to 8.66 (Yüksel & Bahadır Yılmaz, 2020).

Sessions on mindfulness based cognitive therapy are as follows:

*Session 1:* Meeting, information given about how the group will be conducted, expressing expectations and providing information about the concept of mindfulness and giving pre-test.

*Session 2:* Understanding the relationship between cognitive models and cognitive distortions, thinking emotions and behaviour, and achieving the skills to recognize cognitive errors.
Session 3: Mindfulness, being in the here and now, living in the moment, mindful breathing exercises, awareness of daily activities.

Session 4: Automated thinking, questioning its own automatic thoughts, asking the right questions to achieve correct judgment, autopilot introduction.

Session 5: Stress coping methods: What is stress?, What are the effects of stress?, How to deal with stress?

Session 6: Methods for dealing with stress: explaining the concept of non-functional thinking during stressful experiences, dealing with non-functional negative automatic thinking, recognizing evidence for and against negative automatic thinking.

Session 7: Coping with adversity, accepting painful emotions, becoming aware during breathing exercises, body scanning meditation, sound and mind meditation.

Session 8: Evaluate, summarize, get feedback from group members, and give post-test.

Mindfulness Virtual Community

Mindfulness virtual community is an exercise to raise awareness through intentional, present, and non-judgmental attention to previous experiences packaged in web-based or virtual services (Ahmad et al., 2020). The virtual community mindfulness program has a significant reduction effect in reducing anxiety symptoms in nursing students by providing website-based or virtual mindfulness interventions that result in changes in value (7.35; p=0.01)(Ahmad et al., 2020).

The practice sessions contained in the virtual community mindfulness program are as follows:

Session 1: A module on mental health education and youth special attention practices, delivered via video recording for participants to watch and listen to on personal computers, mobile phones and tablets at the right time.

Session 2: Anonymous and asynchronous peer-to-peer discussion boards relating to mental health and mindfulness practices.

Session 3: 20-minute anonymous live videoconference (group-based) on module topics guided by a mental health professional.

Mindfulness Meditation

Mindfulness meditation defined as cultivating the habit of experiencing life consciously and mindfully in the present which focuses on the process meditatively (Stinson et al., 2020). Research conducted by Stinson et al, reported that there was a statistically significant decrease in the anxiety traits of nursing students with the mindfulness meditation intervention with a change in anxiety scores from 44.74 to 39.53.

The program includes eight mindfulness meditation sessions. The meditation practice is led by a person who already has a license to do meditation. This meditation is carried out in a room provided and the atmosphere is set so that it is far from noise and distractions, participants are not allowed to bring personal technology devices during meditation. So as to create a comfortable and calm atmosphere. In the next session, participants were trained to relax by sitting and breathing with their diaphragm. Train the ability in breathing awareness. In the next session, participants were taught the concept of mindfulness, for example, self-compassion, mindful eating, walking meditation and encouraged to practice mindfulness in everyday life.

Mindfulness Spiritual Islam and Acceptance

Mindfulness spiritual Islam and acceptance is a development of mindfulness practice in paying attention in a certain way intentionally, in the present moment and without judging the experiences that are experienced every day (Wiguna et al., 2019). Nursing students who practice mindfulness provide subjective improvements in physical health, psychological well-being, empathy, and well-being. Research conducted by Wiguna et al, shows that mindfulness training using smartphone technology through an android application can reduce anxiety in nursing.
students by decreasing the average anxiety score from 43.55 to 36.50 (Wiguna et al., 2019).

Mindfulness training activities for intervention group respondents were carried out for 6 meetings, each meeting took about 120 minutes. Mindfulness training in this study was conducted by experts who have experience in researching and developing mindfulness interventions. In this study, the intervention group performed mindfulness exercises consisting of 5 stages of activity. The stages of activities carried out include: getting to know mindfulness, mindfulness exercises: thesis as a final project for students, focusing on problems reducing anxiety symptoms, and finally enjoying less time. At the end of the training activity, the researcher again measured the respondents' anxiety scores in both groups.

*Mindfulness Spiritual Intelligence*

Mindfulness spiritual intelligence is the ability of conscious reflection based on experience that allows a person to gain more knowledge, understanding and provide the basis for achieving perfection and progress in life. (Jenaabadi, 2018). Research conducted by Jenaabadi stated that there was a significant decrease in anxiety in nursing students with a significant correlation of spiritual intelligence and mindfulness (p=0.001).

The spiritual intelligence mindfulness program focuses on specific cognitive and metacognitive behavioural strategies to accentuate the attention process, which ultimately leads to the prevention of negative thinking spirals, negative moods, worry tendencies, and the growth of new perspectives and the emergence of pleasant thoughts and joys (Alzahrani et al., 2020).

**DISCUSSION**

This scoping review collects types of mindfulness interventions to reduce anxiety in nursing students. The types of interventions that were obtained in the 5 articles analysed were mindfulness based cognitive therapy, mindfulness meditation, mindfulness virtual community, mindfulness through smartphones, and spiritual mindfulness.

The main sources of anxiety in early-level students are internal and external sources (Ramadhan, Sukohar, & Saftarina, 2019). Internal resources are personal and social resources which include time management for study and finance. While external sources are from academic and clinical (Alzayyat & Al, 2014). Academic demands from coursework, course loads and as well as parental demands on lecture results. Clinical external sources themselves are more clinical practice placements, adaptation to the lecture environment and interactions with environmental components. Research results by Stunden et al., (2015) Nursing student anxiety affects learning outcomes both clinically and academically.

Early-level students who experience anxiety experience both positive and negative impacts. The positive impact of anxiety increases efficiency and intellectual function (Wiguna, Dwidiyanti, & Sari, 2018). While the negative impact of anxiety makes individuals experience a decrease in ability in learning skills and is at risk of decreasing academic results (Bamber & Schneider, 2016). Positive and negative impacts that occur according to the level of anxiety experienced. according to Brown et al., (2020) the impact of anxiety on students in the academic realm contributed to the unsatisfactory results achieved by students.

Mindfulness Intervention become one of the most effective interventions in reducing anxiety in nursing students (Aloufi et al., 2021). From the results of a study by Lamarre & Marcotte (2021) showed that mindfulness acts as a mediating variable in the relationship between maladaptive perfectionism and anxiety in college students. Mindfulness interventions for nursing students can increase the capacity for mindfulness and reduce stress, anxiety, and depression. This will improve students' academic skills, quality of life, well-being, empathy, and emotional control (Kinsella et al., 2020).
Mindfulness which is an exercise that is done by focusing on what is being done and realizing, accepting gracefully the problems at hand without giving bad judgments and not overreacting so as to be able to make goals and focus on solving problems encountered through behaviour change, to increase capacity in dealing with problems (Dwidiyanti, Fahmi, Wahyu, Wiguna, & Munif, 2019). This exercise will have an impact on the coping mechanisms of nursing students in dealing with stressors that occur during academic learning (Shapiro, Schwartz, & Bonner, 1998) Nursing students who have been taught mindfulness techniques have shown subjective improvements in physical and mental health, empathy, and well-being (Beddoe & Murphy, 2004).

The type of mindfulness explored from the analysis results obtained as an intervention that can reduce anxiety in nursing students, the first is mindfulness based cognitive therapy. Several study results state that mindfulness-based cognitive therapy interventions have effective results in reducing anxiety in students (Assumpção, Pena, Neufeld, & Teodoro, 2019; LaGue, Eakin, & Dykeman, 2019; Shabani & Masdari, 2016). The method used in reducing anxiety involves a person's decentralization in observing, evaluating cognitions, emotions and sensations that are felt in the physical and non-judgmental of events that have occurred (LaGue et al., 2019). The theoretical basis is mindfulness-based and integrates cognitive strategies to help a person achieve affective self-regulation through the development of mindful attention.

The second intervention is mindfulness virtual community. This intervention is essentially the same as mindfulness-based cognitive therapy, but focuses on conscious awareness without judging the experiences that have been experienced and related to physical and psychological conditions that are packaged virtually for the purpose of reducing anxiety in the student community (Ahmad et al., 2020). Using the module as a virtual medium given to the student community. Modules in the form of videos that lead to practice to focus on eliminating sources of student stress.

Similar to virtual community mindfulness, there is the development of smartphone-based mindfulness interventions, namely mindfulness through smartphones. This therapy utilizes smartphone media to provide intervention to students. Interventions will be easier to do, if you use supporting devices such as smartphone applications. This can provide an independent learning environment for students to access information and skills such as mindfulness training (Radovic et al., 2016). The use of smartphone mobile devices today, in nursing services has become a growing trend in health services.

Next up is the mindfulness meditation intervention, teaching methods that increase awareness of the present moment and increase awareness of thoughts, emotions, and bodily sensations by calming oneself through meditation (Hoge et al., 2013). Mindfulness meditation teaches you to let your thoughts pass you by without judgment. Meditation is a tool for developing awareness. Mindfulness refers to engagement or curiosity about the present moment, which encourages a non-judgmental attitude of openness and acceptance, thereby fostering balance and stillness (van der Riet, Levett-Jones, & Aquino-Russell, 2018). Several studies suggest that mindfulness meditation is an effective strategy for preventing and managing stress and burnout in the workplace, which often annoy nursing staff and practice students (Hoge et al., 2013; Hölzel et al., 2011; Stinson et al., 2020; Tang, Tang, & Posner, 2016; Zollars, Poirier, & Pailden, 2019).

The last type of intervention explored in the findings is mindfulness spiritual intelligence. Humans in the ups and downs of history have always suffered a great deal of pain and social trauma, and they have sought actions and motives to find ways and means to get rid of them; such a set of knowledge and experience extends certain foundations for human spirituality and religiosity. Spiritual intelligence is an experienced ability that
allows people to gain more knowledge and understanding, and provides the basis for achieving perfection and progress in life (Khosravi & Nikmanesh, 2014). The results of several studies that have been conducted show that increasing spiritual intelligence and spiritual health can reduce anxiety levels (Dadfar, Bahrami, Noghabi, & Askari, 2016; Majidi & Moradi, 2018; Nia et al., 2017). Simply put, a person tends to involve God in times of difficulty and mindfulness spiritual intelligence as a very effective non-pharmacological tool to reduce stress and anxiety (Jenaabadi, 2018).

CONCLUSION

The results of this review can answer the type of mindfulness intervention used to reduce the level of anxiety experienced by nursing students. Mindfulness interventions focus on accepting mindfulness that can change the mindset of students experiencing anxiety to adapt. This intervention was carried out 6 times in one implementation program. The findings obtained from the scoping review process found that there were 5 types of mindfulness that were used effectively to reduce anxiety significantly. There are mindfulness-based cognitive therapy, mindfulness meditation, virtual mindfulness communities, mindfulness spiritual Islam and acceptance, and spiritual mindfulness.

ACKNOWLEDGMENT

Thank you to our parents, colleague and lecturer who supported the completion of this manuscript.

DECLARATION OF CONFLICTING INTEREST

There is no conflict of interest in this study.

FUNDING

This study was funded by own researcher, not sponsored.

AUTHOR CONTRIBUTION

Rikhan Luhur Prasetya: Contribution in the finding idea, preparation, collecting articles and analyzing literature.

Meidiana Dwidiyanti: Contribution to engage in planning and monitoring of scoping literature review work.

Nur Setiawati Dewi: Contribute to discuss the results and contribute to the correction of the final manuscript.

ORCID

Rikhan Luhur Prasetya
https://orcid.org/0000-0003-1561-2109

Meidiana Dwidiyanti
https://orcid.org/0000-0001-9996-566X

Nur Setiawati Dewi
https://orcid.org/0000-0001-6425-5801

REFERENCES


Radovic, A., Vona, P. L., Santostefano, A. M.,


